

International Seminar

**Massification of Higher Education
in Large Academic Systems**

10-11 November 2014, New Delhi

Summary Report

Jointly organized by:

**The Centre for Policy Research in Higher Education
(CPRHE),
National University of Educational Planning and
Administration, New Delhi**

and

The British Council

International Seminar on the Massification of Higher Education in Large Academic Systems

Introduction

This international seminar was the second in a series of dialogues which brings together policy makers and experts from the largest higher education systems in the world. The countries involved are: India, China, Brazil, Indonesia, Nigeria, Pakistan, Russia, USA and the UK. Together, they represent over half of the world's tertiary enrolment. While all these systems are unique in their histories and development, they share a common set of circumstances and challenges related to their scale. These meetings aim to enable these countries to share experiences, paths and strategies for the reform and evolution of their large scale academic systems.

The series of dialogues was initiated by the newly formed Centre for Policy Research in Higher Education (CPRHE), part of the National University of Educational Planning and Administration, India, and the British Council. The first dialogue took place at the British Council's Going Global conference in Miami in May 2014, in which consensus was reached among all participant countries on specific areas affecting higher education that would benefit from cooperation and knowledge exchange among countries with large systems. The meeting concluded with a proposal to organise a seminar in Delhi in November 2014 to discuss in more detail challenges facing higher education in large systems.

The Delhi seminar on the massification of higher education in large system countries was jointly organised by CPRHE and the British Council and held on 10 and 11 November 2014 at the Hotel Jaypee Vasant Continental, New Delhi.

The objectives of the seminar were as follows:

- i) to share experiences in organizing and managing large academic systems
- ii) to discuss strategies to improve quality while expanding access to increasingly diverse student populations
- iii) to discuss governance and management of large academic systems to ensure effectiveness and wider participation
- iv) to discuss strategies of financing a large system of higher education

The participants of the seminar were scholars and policy makers from the nine large system countries (see annex 1 for international participants list), plus representatives from international organizations/agencies and a larger number of academics and policy makers from India.

Brief summary and key themes

The seminar opened with a welcome address by Professor Varghese of the CPRHE/NUEPA, India. Ms. Gill Caldicott of the British Council and Mr. Pawan Agarwal of the Ministry of DSDE, India made opening statements; Professor Ved Prakash, Chairman, University Grants Commission of India, delivered the inaugural address. and Dr. Jinusha Panigrahi, CPRHE/NUEPA proposed a vote of thanks. The concluding session was a round table discussion among the representatives of the participating countries animated by Ms. Lynne Heslop of the British Council. (for full programme see Annex 2)

Nine country policy papers led the discussions

Detailed policy papers were prepared by scholars and/or policy makers from each country on the challenges of their national higher education system on the following themes: implications of massification, governance and management, modes of financing, the academic profession and quality assurance.

These themes were taken up for detailed discussion during the seminar:

1. Global higher education is rapidly expanding

The deliberations in the seminar highlighted the fact that higher education system has been expanding at an unprecedented rate in the first decade of the present century. The global enrolment in higher education increased from 100 million in 2000 to 177.6 million in 2010 accounting for an average annual increase of around 7.6 million students. The participating countries together account for more than half of the total higher education enrolments in the world.

2. Significant variation in the stages of massification in large system countries exist

The HE systems of participating countries are experiencing varying levels and cycles of transition and development. The Russian Federation, the UK and USA have universalised higher education, and while Brazil, China, India and Indonesia have grown their higher education systems, the expansion of higher education in Nigeria and Pakistan have not yet reached a stage of massification. While most countries face the challenges of expanding the system, Russia has to address problems stemming from a declining trend in higher education enrolment.

3. The private sector is playing an increasing role in the expansion of the system

The countries that seriously followed the Geneva resolution of 1924 expanded their higher education systems faster than others, mainly through state funding. However, since then, the context has changed significantly; a larger number of countries today are

dependent on non-state funding to expand their higher education sector. Among the participating countries, Brazil and Indonesia have relied heavily on the private sector to massify their higher education systems, while China and the Russian Federation have relied mostly on public institutions and public funding for their expansion. The USA has traditionally had private higher education institutions; however, they only account for nearly a quarter of enrolments. The UK's public higher education institutions have recently followed a strategy of cost recovery to sustain and expand higher education enrolment. Although India traditionally relied on public institutions and public-funded private institutions (grants-in-aid), the fast expansion of enrolment in the sector in recent years owes more to non-state funded private institutions.

4. Differences in GER trends due to demographic profile and the performance of secondary education

Brazil experiences low GER at the secondary level and it acts as a constraint for the higher education sector to expand. The number of eligible secondary education graduates seeking higher education may not be large enough to meet the expansion plans in higher education. This is one of the reasons why one finds a large number of students (45 per cent) enrolled in higher education in Brazil are mature students. Russia experiences a decline in age-group population and hence, as noted above, a decline in student enrolment. In fact enrolment in higher education in Russia declined from 7.8 million in 2008 to 5.6 million in 2014. All other countries have good potential to expand the system. India has, perhaps, a high potential to expand the system given its demographic dividend. In the 2020s, India will have the largest tertiary education age-group population in the world.

5. Widening inequalities and regional differences persist

Access to higher education continues to be a major problem in Nigeria. The private providers are proliferating in Nigeria and it becomes difficult for the poor to afford higher education in the private institutions. Equity and affordability are major issues in Brazil, India, Indonesia, Nigeria and Pakistan. Although the quota system and affirmative action ensures enrolment of children from disadvantaged background, inequalities in enrolment continues to exist in Brazil and India. China does not have a quota system in admissions. In most countries, access is highly uneven in sociological and geographical terms. This phenomenon affects all countries, including the USA and the UK, albeit to a lesser extent. The discussions indicated that expansion through private institutions seems to have contributed to widening inequalities in access to higher education in most of the participating countries.

6. Quality is a major concern in large system countries

Most countries have developed national qualification frameworks and have established external quality assurance (EQA) mechanisms. The quality concerns vary among countries, with the UK and the USA having strong quality assurance mechanisms. Several countries have established internal quality assurance units in every university.

In Pakistan, quality assurance operates through quality assurance cells established at the institutional level. Quality assurance in Russia appears to focus on attaining European standards.

7. World rankings are an important driver towards improving quality

The debates on world university rankings and on how to develop world class universities are lively in large system countries, and there is concern in some of the countries that their universities do not appear on the list of the top globally ranked universities. In fact, both globally and among the participating countries the USA and UK lead the global rankings of universities. Among the Asian countries, China leads the list of top ranking universities. In many countries there are efforts to set up world class universities. China has specified programmes to encourage graduate teaching and setting up of research universities. Brazil has a programme to establish 'universities of excellence' which are characterized by highly qualified teachers, selected students, priority on research, international collaboration and liberal public funding.

8. Chronic teaching staff shortages are plaguing the systems of many countries

The shortage of teaching staff is a major concern in most of the countries, except the UK and USA. The number of teachers required by the higher education sector may double in India in the current decade. The teaching profession in Brazil is not attractive due to low salaries. Another dimension of the problem is the quality and qualification levels of academic faculty. A majority of the faculty members do not have doctoral degrees in many of the participating countries. There is a need for increased enrolment in graduate courses and accelerated staff development programmes in these countries.

9. Finance strategies are diversifying

The financing of higher education was another area of immediate concern in many countries. The strategies adopted to finance higher education in the participating countries include privatization of public institutions on the one hand and promotion of private institutions on the other. The cost recovery mainly through student fees has become an important source of income in public institutions in many countries. Private higher education institutions have been proliferating in many of the developing countries such as Brazil, India, Indonesia, Nigeria and Pakistan. The universities in many of these countries have also initiated income generating activities. Student loans have become a common mode of financing higher education in the participating countries.

10. Graduate unemployment is a serious issue in most countries

The unemployment rate among the higher education graduates is on the increase. While the economic crisis may be a reason for an increase in unemployment among university graduates in the UK and USA, the major concern expressed in other countries was the education-skill mismatch. Universities are not producing graduates

with relevant skills to be readily employed in the production sectors. In other words, higher education institutions are producing 'unemployables'. In countries such as India, Indonesia, Nigeria, Russia, the employability of the university graduates is an area of major concern and a challenge for reforms.

11. Internationalisation is highly uneven

Some of the systems are more internationalized than others. Among the large system countries, the USA and UK are more internationalized in higher education than the other countries. The USA attracts the largest number of foreign students every year; the UK hosts a higher share of foreign students to their total higher education enrolment than USA. The globalisation process and the demand for graduates trained in skills meeting the requirements of the globalised labor market have hastened the process of internationalization of higher education in the previous decade. India and China are the largest sending countries. Brazil expects to send 100,000 students abroad, mostly to the USA by 2014 under the 'science without borders' programme. A lack of proficiency in international language, notably in English, continues to be a barrier for Brazil in its efforts to internationalise higher education.

12. Conclusions

The discussions in the seminar indicated that while expansion, massification and universalisation of higher education has been achieved in the developed countries mostly through public institutions, countries such as Brazil, India, Indonesia, Nigeria and Pakistan are increasingly reliant on private sector contributions to meet their national demands for higher education. The discussions revealed that there is an urgent need to develop a regulatory framework to ensure equity in access and quality in outcomes to evolve successful systems of higher education.

The papers produced by each country author will be published in one volume and launched at the British Council's Going Global conference in London on 1-2 June, 2015.

We are very grateful to all the speakers, authors, dignitaries and participants for their valuable contributions to this seminar.

Professor N. V. Varghese, Director, CPRHE/NUEPA, New Delhi
Dr .Jinusha Panigrahi, CPRHE/NUEPA, New Delhi

and

Richard Everitt, Director Education, British Council India
Lynne Heslop Senior Education Adviser, British Council India

Annex 1: International participants and authors of papers

S.No.	Name	Designation	Institute
1	Professor Rong Wang (speaker)	Director and Professor of China Institute for Educational Finance Research	Peking University, China
2	Professor Renato Hyuda De Luna Pedrosa (speaker and author)	Coordinator, Special Program of Indicators	São Paulo Research Foundation (FAPESP), Brazil
3	Dr Robin Matross Helms (speaker and author)	Senior Research Specialist, Center for Internationalization and Global Engagement	American Council on Education, USA
4	Dr Mukhtar Ahmed (speaker and author)	Chairman	Higher Education Commission of Pakistan
5	Mr Bagyo Yuwono Moeliodihardjo (speaker and author)	Faculty of Computer Science and Former (Foundation) Dean	University of Indonesia
6	Ms Irina Arzhanova (speaker and author)	Director	National Training Foundation, Russia
7	Mr Christopher JibreelMaiyaki (speaker)	Deputy Director/ Chief of Staff to the Executive Secretary/CEO	National Universities Commission, Nigeria
8	Ms Vivienne Stern (speaker and author)	Director International Unit	Universities UK
9	Professor N.V.Varghese (speaker and author)	Director	CPRHE/NUEPA

Annex 2 Detailed Programme

(Monday) 10 November 2014

12.00 hrs	:	Registration
12.30 hrs	:	Lunch, Venue: <i>Utsav Hall</i>
13.30 hrs	:	Opening Session Welcome: Professor N.V. Varghese, CPRHE/NUEPA Statement: Ms. Gill Caldicott, British Council Statement: Mr. Pawan Agarwal, DSDE, GOI Inaugural Address: Professor Ved Prakash, Chairman, UGC Vote of Thanks: Dr. Jinusha Panigrahi, CPRHE/NUEPA
14.15 hrs	:	Moderated conversation on critical issues in higher education of the participating countries Chairperson: Mr. Richard Everitt, British Council Rapporteur: Dr. Savita Kaushal, NUEPA
15.45 hrs	:	Tea/Coffee Break
16.00 hrs	:	Implications of massification of higher education Chairperson: Mr. Amarjeet Sinha, MHRD Lead Presentations: i) Professor Renato Pedrosa (Brazil) ii) Dr. Rong Wang (China) : Discussant: Mr. Toby Linden, World Bank
16.40 hrs	:	Discussions Rapporteur: Dr. Malish Chirakkal, CPRHE/NUEPA
17.15 hrs	:	Wrap up of the programme, close of Day 1 & evening instructions: Ms. Manjula Rao, British Council
19.00 hrs	:	Reception at British Council, 17 K.G. Marg, New Delhi – 110001

(Tuesday) 11 November 2014

09.15 hrs	:	Welcome: Ms. Manjula Rao, British Council.
09.30 hrs	:	Governance and management of large systems Chairperson: Professor Ananda Krishnan, IIT Kanpur Lead Presentations:

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Ms. Vivienne Stern (UK) ii. Professor N.V. Varghese (India) <p>Discussant: Dr. Padmakumar Nair, Thapar University</p>
10.10 hrs	:	Discussions	
		Rapporteur: Dr. Garima Malik, CPRHE/NUEPA	
10.45 hrs	:	Tea/Coffee Break	
11.15 hrs	:	National financial structures and new modes of financing of higher education	
		Chairperson: Professor Kavita Sharma, SAU	
		Lead Presentations:	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Dr. Robin Matross Helms Christopher (USA) ii. Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed (Pakistan) 	
		Discussant: Professor J.B.G. Tilak, NUEPA	
11.55 hrs	:	Discussions	
		Rapporteur: Dr. Aarti Srivastava, NUEPA	
12.30 hrs	:	Lunch	
13.30 hrs	:	Academic profession and performance measures	
		Chairperson: Professor Karuna Chanana, JNU	
		Lead Presentations:	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Professor Bagyo Yuwono Moeliodihardjo (Indonesia) ii. Mr. Christopher Jibree Imai (Nigeria) 	
		Discussant: Professor G.D. Sharma, SEED	
14.00 hrs	:	Discussions	
	:	Rapporteur: Dr. Tamo Chattopadhyay, CPRHE/NUEPA	
14.45 hrs	:	Quality assurance mechanisms	
		Chairperson: Professor Sukhdeo Thorat, ICSSR	
		Lead Presentations:	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) Ms. Irina Arzhanova (Russia) ii) Dr. Allah Bakhsh Malik (Pakistan) 	
		Discussant: Professor Sudhanshu Bhushan, NUEPA	
15.25 hrs	:	Discussions	
	:	Rapporteur: Dr. Anupam Pachauri, CPRHE/NUEPA	
16.00 hrs	:	Tea/Coffee Break	
16.15 hrs – 17.00 hrs :		Concluding Session	
		Final discussions & reflections	
	:	Chairperson: Ms. Lynne Heslop, British Council	
	:	Vote of Thanks: Dr. Jinusha Panigrahi, CPRHE/NUEPA	